

University of Rochester  
Rubric for Evaluating Dissertation and Oral Defense

Attribute A UR PhD graduate should be able to:	<b>No Revisions Needed</b>	<b>Minor Revisions Needed</b>	<b>Major Revisions Needed</b>
<i>Mark the appropriate column with an "x" to indicate whether revisions are required for each dimension</i>			
<b>Select and defend significant problem or topic for study.</b>	<i>Criteria: Makes a strong and compelling case for significance of topic to the field.</i>		<i>Criteria: Chooses significant topic but not fully placed in context</i>
<b>Demonstrate mastery of relevant knowledge in the field.</b>	<i>Criteria: Shows innovative and valuable critique of relevant work in the field</i>		<i>Criteria: Demonstrates adequate knowledge of relevant work in the field</i>
<b>Apply rigorous methods of the discipline.</b>	<i>Criteria: Quality of scholarship is innovative, thorough, rigorous</i>		<i>Criteria: Approach demonstrates adequate rigor</i>
<b>Produce a valuable contribution to the field</b>	<i>Criteria: Outcome moves field forward significantly and insightfully</i>		<i>Criteria: Outcome of work is useful to the field</i>
<b>Communicate effectively in academic writing.</b>	<i>Criteria: Writing is very high quality, fluent, clear and effective</i>		<i>Criteria: Writing is correct and easily understood</i>
<b>Effectively defend the work when questioned.</b>	<i>Criteria: Responses are well-argued, insightful, and engaging</i>		<i>Criteria: Able to answer most questions effectively and explains reasoning</i>
<b>Comments:</b>			